

**BEN FRANKLIN TRANSIT
BOARD OF DIRECTORS DRAFT MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, January 12, 2017 at 7:00 p.m.
1000 Columbia Park Trail, Richland, WA**

1. Meeting called to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. Roll Call: MATT WATKINS (Chairman) BOB KOCH (Vice-Chairman), RICHARD BLOOM, STEVE BECKEN, STEVE YOUNG, TERRY CHRISTENSEN, SHON SMALL (RICK MILLER, NORMA NELSON Excused)

CHAIRMAN WATKINS, announced that a quorum of the Board was present at roll call.

Staff: Tony Kalmbach, Dr. John Myers, Terry DeJuan, Jerry Otto, Tom Turner, Katherine Ostrom, Wendi Warner, Rob Orvis, Kevin Hebdon, Gloria Boyce, Patrick Roach, Legal Counsel, Michaela Dimas

Visitors: John Chapman, Richland, WA and Richard Johnston, Richland, WA.

3. **Pledge of Allegiance**

CHAIRMAN WATKINS asked attendees to please stand for the Pledge of Allegiance.

Citizens Public Comment/Introduction of Visitors

CHAIRMAN WATKINS invited public comment on any item that is not on the agenda.

Richard Johnston, Richland, WA, informed the Board of the need for bus services in the Horn Rapids area in Richland. He stated he has contacted Ben Franklin Transit (BFT) staff with this request and asked if a density plan was available. He still has not received a definite answer and would like to know what BFT needs to add service. Currently, residence of the area must walk 3 miles to get to the closest bus stop. There are many adults, children and students that will benefit if services were added.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS, informed Mr. Johnston the Horn Rapids area is a part of the PTBA. He asked staff what kind of services are available for the Horn Rapids Area.

Tony Kalmbach, Planning & Service Development Manager, stated BFT currently offers Taxi Feeder services for that area. Tony Kalmbach provided Mr. Johnston with information on how taxi feeder services work. Gloria Boyce, General Manager provided Mr. Johnston with her business card.

John Chapman, Richland, WA, equally conveyed the need for service in the Horn Rapids area. Gloria Boyce provided Mr. Chapman her business card and asked for both Mr. Johnson and Mr. Chapman to contact her.

A brief discussion was held.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS encouraged Richard Johnston and John Chapman to speak with BFT staff.

No other public comments were given.

4. Approval of Agenda

CHAIRMAN WATKINS stated that there will be an Executive Session. It will be announced prior to recess of the Regular Board of Director's meeting.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for a motion to approve the Agenda as presented.

ACTION: STEVE YOUNG made and BOB KOCH seconded a motion to approve the agenda.
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

5. Retirement Resolution

- A. Resolution 01-2017- Kirk Smith, Coach Operator
September 15, 2008 – October 31, 2016

Katherine Ostrom, Assistant Operations Manager, stated Kirk Smith and Michael Fraser are not present at the Board meeting.

Katherine Ostrom read from the resolution and stated that Kirk Smith has served BFT and our community well in the capacity of Coach Operator for almost eight (8) years. Kirk was an exceptionally dependable employee with no sick occurrences during his entire career. Year after year Kirk received "Exceeds Standards" under Dependability on his annual evaluation. It was noted on his last annual evaluation "Kirk you are a valued employee, I can depend on you to be here every day to do your job in a very professional manner." Kirk was a five-year recipient of the National Safe Driver Award; a huge accomplishment. Not only did Kirk receive "Exceeds Standards" under Dependability year after year, but he also received "Exceeds Standards" under Quality of Work and Cooperation. You do not find many employees that reach this level of excellence, but Kirk did, and he truly was an asset to BFT and our community. A BFT Supervisor once wrote this about him "Kirk you are a team player and you get along with everyone. Thank you for all your hard work." This operator was an exemplary employee and a privilege to have on our team. Kirk performed his duties with quiet excellence, never wanting to be the center of attention and always striving to do his job to the best of his ability. Kirk, we will miss you, best wishes to you in your retirement!

CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for a motion to approve Resolution 01-2017.

ACTION: RICHARD BLOOM made and LISA STADE seconded a motion to approve Resolution 01- 2017 as presented. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

- B. Resolution 02-2017- Michael Fraser, Coach Operator
February 7, 2004 – November 4, 2016

Katherine Ostrom, Assistant Operations Manager, read from the resolution and stated Michael Fraser, Coach Operator Michael Fraser has served BFT and our community honorably in the capacity of Coach Operator for the past 12 years. Thank you for your dedicated service Michael. Incredibly, Michael earned a National Safe Driver Award every year of his career, this is a rare achievement and one in which he should be very proud. Michael has also received "Exceeds Standards" under safety, on almost every evaluation given by his supervisors. Well done Michael. Michael was a very dependable employee, receiving "Exceeds Standards" under dependability on every single evaluation. Again a noteworthy achievement. Michael is a true professional and an asset to BFT; Fixed Route Supervisors comments about Michael have included over the years "Michael is dependable and operates the coach safely... Excellent customer service skills." And Michael is a great pleasure to work with, he has displayed a willingness to listen and clearly is interested in doing his best every day." Michael Fraser has been an exemplary employee and a privilege to have on our team. He performed his duties with quiet excellence, always

striving to do his job to the best of his ability. This employee we will miss by all. Congratulations to you in your retirement!

CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for a motion to approve Resolution 02-2017.

ACTION: RICHARD BLOOM made and LISA STADE seconded a motion to approve Resolution 01-2017 as presented. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS expressed his thanks to Kirk Smith and Michael Fraser for their service to BFT. A Certificate of Commendation and Lifetime Bus Pass will be sent to both retirees.

6. Board Committee Reports – Meeting Notes were included in the Board Packet

A. Operations & Maintenance Committee, Rick Miller, Chair- Cancelled

No report, meeting cancelled.

B. Planning & Marketing Committee, Rick Miller, Chair-Cancelled

No report, meeting cancelled.

C. Administration & Finance Committee, Steve Becken, Chair

BOB KOCH, gave an overview of the items discussed during the Committee meeting. Notes were provided in the packet.

7. Consent Agenda (Any item is open for discussion at Board or Public Request)

- A. Approval of December 8, 2016 Board Meeting Minutes
- B. Payroll/Voucher Summary
- C. Resolution 03-2017 – Authorizing the General Manager to utilize contract options to extend Garda CL Northwest, Inc. for Cash Vault Services.

December 2016 vouchers audited and certified by Ben Franklin Transit’s auditing officer as required by RCW 42.24.080, and those expense reimbursement claims certified as required by RCW 42.24.090, have been recorded on a listing, which was emailed to the Board Members December 8, 2016.

Payroll

Check Register Number	Check Number/ Number		Date of Issue	in the Amount	
527-16	78735	78763	12/9/2016	359,148.81	Payroll
528-16	78764	78791	12/23/2016	386,721.65	Payroll
529-16	78792	78793	12/23/2016	283.09	Payroll
				Total	\$746,153.55

Non-Payroll Vouchers

232-16	63021	63076	12/2/2016	81,154.95	MDSE
--------	-------	-------	-----------	-----------	------

233-16	63077	63134	12/9/2016	287,834.69	MDSE
234-16	63135	63142	12/12/2016	18,730.23	MDSE
235-16	ACH Transactions		12/12/2016	613,441.56	ACH TRANS
236-16	63143	63135	12/16/2016	73,963.28	MDSE
237-16	ACH Transactions		12/16/2016	2,060.30	ACH TRANS
238-16	63206	63205	12/23/2016	240,064.18	MDSE
239-16	63264	63263	12/23/2016	-	VOID
240-16	63271	63270	12/23/2016	87,620.45	MDSE
241-16	63290	63289	12/26/2016	78,465.43	MDSE
242-16	63304	63303	12/30/2016	99,854.74	MDSE
243-16	ACH Transactions		12/30/2016	148,531.75	ACH TRANS
244-16	ACH Transactions		12/31/2016	60.24	ACH TRANS
				Total	\$1,731,781.80

Check Register Numbers 527-16 to 529-16 and 232-16 to 244-16
In the total amount of:

\$2,477,935.35

CHAIRMAN WATKINS read aloud the items on the Consent Agenda and called for a motion to approve the Consent Agenda as presented.

ACTION: BOB KOCH made and STEVE YOUNG seconded a motion to approve the Consent Agenda as presented. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

(BFT Board Standing Committees Recommended Approval of Consent Items to the Full Board of Directors)

8. Action Items

A. Resolution 04-2017– Rescinding Resolution 17-2012 and Adopting Resolution 04-2017

Tony Kalmbach, Planning & Service Development Manager spoke to the resolution. Stating Resolution 04-2017 - Rescinding Resolution 17-2012 and Adoption of Resolution 04- 2017 Establishing All Fares. Resolution 17-2012 was adopted by the Board on April 12, 2012, it provides guidelines and definitions detailing specific service and fare types recognized by BFT. Additionally, Resolution 17-2012 includes specific language regarding retirees, Board, Dial-A-Ride Committee and Community Advisory Committee (CAC) passes.

Currently, there is no specific language in the Resolution or the Policy Procedure Guide (PPG) that specifically states what services employee and dependent passes can be used for. The PPG includes language about staff and their dependents receiving passes and identifies what BFT considers an eligible dependent, but does not clearly indicate what services can be utilized.

Resolution 17-2012 has been updated to include specific information in regards to services that can be accessed by staff and their dependents (see Exhibit “A”). In addition, staff has updated the name of the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC) to the newly adopted Citizens Advisory Network (CAN).

Tony Kalmbach, stated staff recommends BFT Board rescind Resolution 17-2012 in its entirety and adopt Resolution 04-2017 Establishing All Fares.

ACTION: RICHARD BLOOM made and LISA STADE seconded a motion to approve Resolution 04-2017 Rescinding Resolution 17-2012 and Adopting Resolution 04-2017. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

(BFT Board Standing Committees recommended approval of Action Items to the Full Board of Directors)

9. Discussion/Information Items

- A. Citizens Advisory Network Report- No report
- B. 2016 Q4 Performance Report

Tony Kalmbach, Planning & Service Development Manager presented a power point presentation on the Quarter 4 Performance Report. Stating Total system ridership is down for all modes; Decembers decline can be primarily attributed to the inclement weather. Additionally, days of service is what caused the disparity for October and November. There was one additional weekday of operation in November and one less weekday in October as compared over 2015. Fixed route ridership is down 8.8%, this is not just a BFT trend, but a trend being seen across the nation. A decrease in ridership can be connected to the continuing low fuel prices, a better economic outlook and a recent change in ridership reporting to the National Transit Database.

Tony Kalmbach continued by stating he would like to suggest a positive from this report, and that it supports the Boards decision and staff efforts in regards to the Comprehensive Service Plan Study implementation. It is our hope that the service recommendations will help to revitalize BFT's services, help put a core service into place, and address the needs of our community. While the CSPS is not a fix all, in combination with the technology improvements BFT will begin to develop a robust means to understand the continued growth and need of our community.

Taxi ridership is trending relatively flat, the difference in the graph looks more dramatic that it is as total ridership was only down .2% or 254 boardings. Ridership growth in October and November primarily are in Sunday Service, and a small amount in Night Service.

Dial a Ride, total paratransit boardings are up .4% over 2015. This is not necessarily a bad thing as paratransit in a costly service with the idea/goal of moving people to our Fixed Route services. Therefore, the decline in ridership is not necessarily a bad thing. We are also seeing a dip in ridership for December due to inclement weather.

Eligibility Data out of the total applications received for quarter 4, a majority of applications were re-certifications or approvals on a temporary basis. Temporary basis could include the change in weather or a short term medical condition like a surgery. In quarter four BFT received roughly 1,500 applications.

Statistical and on time performance for October, November, and December was good for on-time performance. Even with the inclement weather, Dial-A-Ride in Prosser and Tri-Cities continue to maintain excellent on-time performance.

Vanpool boardings are down overall 2016 over 2015 is trending down 9.3%. Going forward our goal is to continue community outreach and try to encourage people to use our Vanpool program. It is beneficial for our communities, helps get single occupant vehicle off the road, and helps prevent wear and tear on our roads.

For Vanpool stats, there were 14 less vans on the road in 2016. In 2016 we saw 30 new van starts and only 44 van closures contrasting the 84 closures in 2015. It is BFT's plan with aggressive outreach to major employers BFT can grow the Vanpool ridership in 2017.

Marketing & Outreach:

October:

- Oct. 1, REACH Fall Presentation booth
- Oct. 9, Washington State Ridesharing Organization Fall Conference, attendance and welcome remarks by Ms. Boyce
- Oct. 15, 2016 Health & Wellness Fair booth, Kennewick Walmart
- Oct. 17, Poster Contest launch
- Oct. 18, Fall Senior Trade Show booth, Pasco Red Lion

November:

- Nov. 4, Veterans Stand Down booth
- Nov. 9, Trolley Ribbon Cutting Ceremony with Board, media and business community
- Nov. 11, Veterans Day recognition
- Nov. 12, Trolley launch event for the community

December:

- Dec. 10, Pasco Tree Lighting – trolley at the event
- Dec. 17, Fill the Trolley food drive to benefit local food banks

2016 Goals & Initiatives Q4:

BFT's current six major projects currently being working on and how they align with BFT's Major Goals and Objectives. Our major projects are the following:

1. Safety- on Track.
2. Comprehensive Service Plan Study- on Track.
3. Citizen's Advisory Committee Review- on Track. Currently, staff is working on to recruitment.
4. Transit Technology Implementation is currently delayed due to a funding change from local to federal, staff anticipates this being completed by the end of February.
5. Succession Planning & Staff Development is delayed, staff was not able to complete Covey training for all staff, this will be completed in early 2017.
6. Comprehensive Employer Review is delayed due to staff transition. We will be getting that up to speed in 2017.
7. Facilities Upgrades has been delayed in two areas. The replacement of the anti-freeze tank has been delayed due to inclement weather. The second BFT has decided to not only fix Knight St and 22nd St Transit Centers, but to update amenities and conduct a re-design of both facilities.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS commented on how the report given was thorough and detailed. He continued by stating the style of the report is maturing and is very presentable in providing information to the Board.

10. Staff Reports & Comments

A. Legal Report

Patrick Roach, Legal Counsel, stated there are no new legal matters to bring to the Board's attention. An Executive Session will be held for approximately 30 minutes regarding personnel. The RCW is 42.30.110 sub-section (1g). Announcement to the public will be made if more time is needed.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS asked if action is expected. Patrick Roach stated no action would be taken.

B. Financial Report

Kevin Hebdon, Administrative Service Manager, reported Sales Tax revenue for November 2016 continue to trend over budget on our revenues and under budget on our expenditures. The bulk of our under

expenditures on operating budget are due to fuel. Fuel is less expensive than anticipated so this is where the bulk of our savings is at. To be exact we are 1.3 million under budget and our revenues are 1.8 million thru November. Some indicators in comparing our cost per mile and our allocated cost per boarding. Compared to an actual budgeted and that helps identify any variance that something may be askew. As of November 30th there is nothing here of significant concern, things appear to be trending properly.

Finance report actual cash balance of the Ben Franklin Transit happy to report the funds are secure with our bank in the LGIP. Funds are accounted and secure. We have our 3 months operating reserve at full capacity. Funds available for Capital, I don't foresee an issue of 28 million then we take out our local match for our program capital projects and procurements of about 2.4 million there and then we got our fund balance at 25.6 million to fund ongoing capital commitments. We have also talked about a previous meeting the reserve fund analysis that going on. Our goal is to bring that to you through the committee, the Admin & Finance committee would be a recommendation for a policy. We will go through that analysis and see what is prudent, what is best practice, and industry standard as far as what our needs are for reserve fund balance looking forward to that.

Ben Franklin Transit Sales Tax report for December an increase of 8.9% over what we received last year at this time. As a reminder, we receive in December for October business. We see that same trend on your table there tonight was not available for the Board packet mail out nor was it available for the Admin & Finance Committee. But the PTBAs and Local Jurisdictions are also trending similar to what we are seeing here. With the local jurisdictions seeing about an average of 6.5% increase year to date over last year ytd. Where PTBAs are seeing 10.4% increase ytd as compared to last year. Maybe the indication growth and economics stability throughout not only locally but throughout the state.

One other item that was not in your packet... I wanted to bring to the attention of the BFT Board of Directors. The agency has received from the Government Finance Officers Association (GFOA) Certificate of Achievement for excellence in financial reporting for 2015 Comprehensive Financial report. The fourth year running, Mr. Chair is counting the little circles here. Wanted to bring that to your attention. It takes the GFOA a little while to review all the submittals and they are just now getting back to us. The 2015 Comprehensive Annual Financial Report is available if not yet today it should be there shortly on our website with all the prior years as well as hard copies for any of the Board members that would like that. I wanted to talk a little bit about what goes behind that. It is an indication of sound financial internal controls and a group effort not just the finance department but throughout the whole agency and following policy reporting and all the information that goes out into this comprehensive annual financial report. We are, we will continue to submit at that and we are now working on our 2016 CAFR. We will be submitting that to GFOA as well. I wanted to make you aware reported on November and we are working on December close as well. Happy to report that it appears that we are well under budget on our expenditures and over our riders as well. We should not have any need for any kind of budget amendment for 2016. This concludes my report. I would be happy to answer any questions.

SHON SMALL congratulations along with the team on that achievement. I hope people truly understand what a feat that is. It's a job well done.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS this report and last report have been matured over the last year and finding this information more helpful than previous information I've been provided.

VICE CHAIRMAN KOCH it is easier to comprehend.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS one other question. Are audit cycles coming up?

Kevin Hebdon we just finished an accountability audit for the 2015 year. The schedule of the Washington State Auditor's office local office here for mid to late March for financial and federal audit. We also have our National Transit Database (NTD) review that happens to with all our federal fund and allocation methodologies and data submitted to the NTD that is now under the requirement that it is now reviewed annually.

A brief discussion was held.

C. General Manager's Report

Gloria Boyce, General Manager, reported on the following:

Government Affairs Update

Federal: A senate hearing was held on the selection of Elaine Chao as the candidate for Secretary of Transportation. I'm not sure what the outcome was.

State: No new transit developments at the State level.

Operations:

Busy month for Operations due to inclement weather. I cannot say enough on the efforts of our staff. It is incredible to watch a team pull together for snow events such as what we have had. Not only our operators on the road but our maintenance, admin, and customer service staff incredible to keep the service running.

A few stats I would like to share with you. Of the nine number of days of snows we have deviated service on those nine days from one to eight routes. Routes with hills and side streets that were not plowed. Of those nine days, we run approximately seventy-four to seventy-six hundred miles a day is what we perform on just fixed route. It varies on Dial a Ride(DAR). We have had less than five incidences in both DAR and fixed route. Of those twenty events, approximately a >>> of those events are of passengers slipping or falling on the ice. For the amount of miles that we have driven to have less than 20 and less than 15 actual events is impressive. For stuck vehicles, we have had for 45 for DAR and 12 buses stuck. Sometimes a tow truck sometimes with a good push. We have had 9 employee call outs due to weather this week. We did not have a delay all our employees showed up. Additional calls into our DAR department. So, we have staff for an average call those average calls have 3 to 4 people took an additional 1,000 calls over the last month. Primarily most of them this week.

In Vanpool, we had two vans that were stuck from lots that were not being cleared. Night service didn't have service 2 days. Service was cut from 6:30 p.m. to 12:30 a.m. Primarily our night service is curbside service and they could not have access to a number of those curbs, folks had to walk out to catch the night service.

On time performance for DAR has been consistently at the 90. So, Tony gave me the last year average of our on-time performance.

Customer service has been managing a double volume of calls more than normal. Maintenance folks have work around the clock. I think they are actually sleeping in the maintenance building. They are here at 3 in the morning and come early and start, they are out and make sure snow is cleared and you can get through the yard, transit centers, park n ride lots, and our platforms. There was not a snow shovel to be had. It was a great job with not only our own maintenance (inaudible).

Ridership: our school delays that happened throughout our community were not affected by our 2-hour school delays. Students still being on the buses when they delay school. However, the closures did affect us. About a third of our ridership is students. The last 2-3 days our ridership is down by about 28%. We went out there on the road and meet an operator and thanked them profusely for their many times going the extra mile just to make sure folks can ride the bus. I just want to say what a great job we've done we are hoping and thinking Spring.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS one of the observations is that clearly this is an unusual snow year. I hope even though the Tri-Cities is use to a couple days of snow. Folks have been using bus service instead of their own transportation due to the snow to go out and get groceries. Pasco had plan a for the night and then plan b and they noted they had talked with transit and modified a few things to make it more comparable. I see some coordination through an unusual event. Hopefully, we can capitalize on that and make that prior to the next snow event.

Gloria Boyce stated that is a good point. We have reached out to the cities. We have been to the city of Pasco. Tony was in contact with the Director of Public Works at the city of Richland. There is coordination with all the cities. We are continuing to reach out to those folks, so we appreciate the collaboration of those jurisdictions.

Gloria Boyce stated Pat Roach has reminded her BFT provided warming buses for the fire fighters in the jurisdictions they were very appreciative of that. Additionally, day before yesterday I82 was closed because of the danger/accident and they called for a warming van. They couldn't get us through so Supervisor Paul Singer was stuck in the traffic for 4 hours. We are happy to be here for the community to share the assets and support our (inaudible)

CHAIRMAN WATKINS I want to thank staff very much for all their efforts during this time.

11. Board Member Comments

SHON SMALL stated what a great level of service has been provided to the citizens of the community. He commented that the delivery of staff reports is short and precise. Great work and we appreciate that. He provided information on the challenges the snow has brought to Benton County.

TERRY CHRISTENSEN stated the City of Richland is busy plowing streets due to the inclement weather. There are many citizens coming together to help each other out.

RICHARD BLOOM reflected on the sales tax figures of West Richland. He returned from a sunny vacation and he was welcomed with snowy weather.

MATT WATKINS wanted to thank Kennewick for their efforts to find the right mix for a safe option for Transportation Network Companies aka Uber and Lift. Pasco will be addressing this on Monday. It is clear that in the Tri-Cities, Uber and Lift will be available in the very near future. Another transportation option for citizens in the Community.

BOB KOCH stated he was in the fire service for several years. He expressed his appreciation for warming buses being provided to Fire Fighters.

STEVE YOUNG commented on the how BFT staff presents reports is the best he has seen. He has enjoyed coming to Board meetings due to the efficiency of the reports and will be taking ideas to the City of Kennewick.

STEVE BECKEN stated it was a lot warmer in Arizona.

LISA STADE stated things are going well in Benton City. She has appreciated the efforts people have been making to help each other out in this weather.

MATT WATKINS read a posting on Facebook: "Shout out to Captain Bachman of the Kennewick Fire Department for coming the aid of a visually impaired gentleman walking in the roadway due to heavy snow on the sidewalks. Crews stopped, picked him up and provided him a ride to the transit transfer center". CHAIRMAN WATKINS stated this is probably one of many stories we will hear on how members of the community are coming together to help each other out due to the inclement weather.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS announced that the meeting would be going into Executive Session. Noting that the Executive Session will most likely take about 30 minutes. He recessed the Regular Board of Directors meeting into Executive Session at 7:55 p.m. until about 8:25 p.m. Following the Executive Session, the Regular Board meeting will adjourn.

12. Next Meeting – Thursday, February 9, 2016 at 7:00 p.m.
1000 Columbia Park Trail, Richland WA

13. Executive Session

Executive Session held.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS notified the waiting public at 8:28 p.m. that ten additional minutes was needed for the Executive Session.

Re-convene into Open Session

CHAIRMAN WATKINS reconvened the Regular BFT Board of Directors Meeting into Open Session at 8:36 p.m. He thanked everyone for their patience in waiting for the additional time extension needed to complete the Executive Session. No action taken.

14. Adjournment

CHAIRMAN WATKINS promptly adjourned the reconvened open meeting of the BFT Board of Directors meeting at 8:36 p.m.

Meeting recorded by:
Michaela Dimas, Clerk of the Board
January 12, 2017