

**BEN FRANKLIN TRANSIT
BOARD OF DIRECTORS REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, November 8, 2018 at 7:00 p.m.
1000 Columbia Park Trail, Richland WA**

1. CHAIRMAN WATKINS called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.
2. Roll Call: MATT WATKINS (Chairman), BOB KOCH (Vice-Chairman), RICHARD BLOOM, JOHN TRUMBO, LISA STADE, STEVE BECKEN

SHON SMALL, BOB THOMPSON, RICK MILLER and NORMA NELSON (Non-Voting Union Representative) excused

Staff:

Gloria Boyce, Jeremy Bishop – Legal Counsel, Jerry Otto, Matthew Branson, Keith Hall, Ali Madison, Wendi Warner, Amanda Para, Tom Turner, Rob Orvis

3. **Pledge of Allegiance**

CHAIRMAN WATKINS invited all in attendance in the Pledge of Allegiance.

4. **Citizen's Public Comment/Introduction of Visitors**

CHAIRMAN WATKINS acknowledged a full room of guests and requested staff to provide a special report related to Taxi, Feeder, Night and Sunday service and take questions. CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for public comment on any items not further along on the agenda.

Paul Singer, Kennewick, shared concerns on the accuracy of a previous statement made by the General Manager regarding service provided by the Arc, being non-compliant with ADA. Mr. Singer alleged this is incorrect information. Secondly, Mr. Singer shared concerns regarding alleged previous knowledge of Tri City Taxi's business struggles. Lastly, Mr. Singer referenced Initiative 695, and shared with the Board that the 3/10 tax increase was only because the community agreed that the disabled and senior community deserve these services.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS stated the floor is still open for public comments. Hearing none, he continued with the agenda.

5. Approval of Agenda

CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for a motion to approve the agenda as presented with one special report to be presented as 7B. Taxi, Feeder, Night and Sunday service.

ACTION: BOB KOCH made, and STEVE BECKEN seconded a motion to approve the amended agenda. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

6. Recognitions

A. Introduction of Keith Hall, Director of Planning and Service Development.

Ms. Boyce stated Keith has 28 years of international experience in transit service, land use, and transportation infrastructure. His recent transit planning experience includes transit planning for the Atlanta BeltLine light rail transit (LRT) program, as well as large-scale LRT projects in Toronto and Edmonton and supporting bus and light rail transit studies in New Zealand and Australia.

Keith has also developed operations and service plans, corridor infrastructure plans, and long-range plans for a variety of transit modes including bus network service, high-occupancy vehicle lane bus service plans, and service and infrastructure improvement plans for bus rapid transit, commuter rail, and light rail transit. He completed his bachelors and master's degrees at University of Texas at Austin and is currently undertaking an urban design program at Simon Fraser University in Vancouver, British Columbia. Welcome to the BFT team, Keith!

CHAIRMAN WATKINS thanked Ms. Boyce and welcome Mr. Hall. He opened the floor for comments to which there were none.

7. Special Reports

A. Citizen's Advisory Network (CAN) Report

- i) Karyn Vandecar, Chair and Bill Hoage, CAN Member shared an update to the Board from their October 29 meeting. The CAN will then determine their 2019 meeting schedule. Ms. Vandecar challenged the Board to provide the CAN a project they can sink their teeth into. As the eyes and ears of the community, we are able to provide unique insights. Elections will be held in January and the CAN looks forward to meeting more frequently. Ms. Vandecar thanked the staff for their ongoing support. CHAIRMAN WATKINS thanked the CAN for their commitment to the committee and the Board looks forward to hearing more in the future.

B. Taxi, Feeder, Night and Sunday Service Update

- i) Gloria Boyce, General Manager stated that on October 30, BFT Staff were informed of Tri City Taxi's immediate closure effective midnight October 30. Both BFT staff and TCT began to inform the community. Staff kicked into action-mode and informed all scheduled rides for the following days, medical centers, media, schools, and

community partners to provide as much information to the community as quickly as possible. The influx of calls in customer service, which extended hours, were de minimis. We appreciate the community's involvement in getting the word out. There were absolutely some impacts to folks with scheduled rides. We are suggesting the following alternative solutions: vanpool and community van. Moving forward we have been working on potential options. We currently have about 3 options. We can release RFP for ancillary services, which would take 3-4 months if we get someone to respond. Previously the RFP only got one response, TCT. The number one concern when we asked those who chose not to bid, stated the work volume is not high enough, as well as other companies that are just too small to assist. Secondly, we are looking at potentially segmenting geographically or by service type. Thirdly, we are looking to see if we can bring in all services in-house. We continue to crunch the numbers and evaluate this potential option. I cannot commend TCT enough for their quick assistance in providing manifests. We have also taken the information and began a deep-dive analytical approach to see where the services are most affected. Other internal programs we continue to review are the surplus policy, the community can program, vanpool, etc. We feel feeder, Sunday and Dial-A-Ride overflow are the rides we feel we can replace the fastest. We are looking at extending service hours. I would also like to ask the Board to amend the current ARC contract to allow them to run later into the evening for previously scheduled events until we can better understand this large disruption. These return trips were previously provided by Night service and Tri City Taxi. I anticipate another 1-2 weeks before we fully understand all of our options.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for Board questions. RICHARD BLOOM stated of the 5,000 boarding per month, what percentage were ADA related. Gloria Boyce stated approximately 2.4% on night and 7.9% on Sunday. RICHARD BLOOM inquired is TCT liquidated their assets. Gloria Boyce stated they have not, under advice of their legal counsel. JOHN TRUMBO reiterated that staff feels a solution will not be determined for at least 1-2 weeks, correct? Gloria Boyce, stated yes, with the exception of the ARC events. JOHN TRUMBO inquired on night service extending for one class of people? Gloria Boyce stated we do not discriminate on trip type. JOHN TRUMBO clarified if there is a federal regulation limiting providing trips for only seniors and disabled. Gloria Boyce stated any fixed route extension provides an automatic extension of ADA services per federal regulations. A large population could be reached in the 8pm-10pm service time, which could be satisfied by "Owl Service," which is focusing on major corridors with a reduced fleet.

RICHARD BLOOM asked is the extension of service with ARC would increase the contract. Gloria Boyce stated no, it would be trips that would have been charged to taxi but would be transferred to ARC. Discussion continued. Ms. Boyce reiterated she is seeking permission to amend that contract to allow for return trip service.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS asked this be added to the agenda as ACTION item 10. CHAIRMAN WATKINS continued and summarized all potential options as present by Ms. Boyce.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS opened the floor for comments.

Rusty of Finley, expressed concerns about getting to medical appointments and the current situation prohibits his inability to get to any job appointments, or other personal appointments.

Tina Collins of Finley, stated that extension of service until 10:30pm would provide rides until 10pm. They'll miss holiday events and won't be able to attend family functions. Ms. Collins then read a letter from Dominic Charvet stating *"It is important to me to be able to go out in the evening and on Sunday. Can you please have dial a ride running until 10pm and on Sundays. Thank you."* Tina then inquired regarding Freedom passes and those purchased on year in advance.

Citizen (no name provided), shared that the service disruption has limited his ability to get home from work at the Toyota Center, and has greatly affected him.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS deferred to Gloria Boyce. Ms. Boyce stated refunds can be provided at Three Rivers Transit. Absolutely passes purchased in advance would be refunded.

Discussion was held on ARC services provided, and those being requested for extension, which only includes special events previously scheduled. MS Boyce stated work trips do not have solution as of yet. We believe we can bring feeder service back on line the quickest by bringing it in internally.

Bill Hoage, stated that the people in Finley voted themselves into the sales tax increase years ago. The service we have been getting is what the transit decided is best for them. The citizens of Finley are still paying sales tax with no service.

Christina Tag, of Tri City Residential Services, expressed concerns on limitations currently for those in wheelchairs. She continued that work schedules are being affected, among other things.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS stated that TCT has had ups and downs, but the recent contract indicated they were in it for the long haul. Gloria Boyce stated that staff have been in negotiations with TCT with no indication that they were stopping services. The financial reports showed they were viable. She continued that we should not assume that circumstance beyond their control do not limit to only financial reasons for closure. Their finances were analyzed, and we moved forward.

Citizen, no name provided, these services being ended take away our independence. Alternative solutions like Uber are too expensive.

Paul Singer, stated that when TCT came to BFT one year ago with financial issues, why was a contingency not put in place. Regarding the RICHARD BLOOM question regarding the percentage of wheelchair use, the figures are probably low due to the cap and poor service.

Jennifer Humble, encouraged the Board to consider wheelchair accessible options as even the previous providers had limited lift-enabled vehicles.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS inquired staff for comments. Ms. Boyce stated that BFT will take all comments and concerns into account and thanked all those for sharing their comments. She continued, stating the website, bft.org has the most up-to-date information on options.

Justin Crume, of Columbia Industries, inquired on capped service numbers, as well as night service funding as well as how community van and vanpool would work as potential solutions.

Ms. Boyce stated the data shows clustered trips, which we do have programs available to help groups of five or more.

Discussion was held on capped service.

Bryan McDermott, expressed that a “triage” approach could have been effective. Ms. Boyce expressed that life-saving medical trips were the first trips addressed and that the Board is being presented with the options to determine how to proceed. Discussion held on surplus vans.

Jen Hampson, addressed ADA matching fixed route and shared concerns on big buses being used, when we have other rides that are in greater need. She also recounted email sent to Shon Small, and BFT. Ms. Boyce stated staff are working to respond, as many points were raised.

Christine Tag, expressed concerns on logistics of community van program. Ms. Boyce reiterated that staff are currently reviewing the analytics.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for a special meeting to discuss and indicated the date will be shared via social media, public meeting notice, etc. CHAIRMAN WATKINS then called for any additional public comments. To which there were none.

8. Board Committee Reports

CHAIRMAN WATKINS indicated for the sake of time, we will continue on over the committee reports unless Board feels there are notable items to report. None reported.

A. Operations & Maintenance Committee, RICK MILLER, Chair

B. Planning & Marketing Committee, RICHARD BLOOM, Chair - CANCELLED

C. Administration & Finance Committee, STEVE BECKEN, Chair

CHAIRMAN WATKINS opened for questions or comments, to which there were none.

9. Consent Agenda (Any item is open for discussion at Board or Public Request)

- A. Approval of October 11, 2018 Special Board Meeting Minutes
- B. Approval of October 11, 2018 Board Meeting Minutes
- C. October Voucher Summary

October 2018 vouchers audited and certified by Ben Franklin Transit's auditing officer as required by RCW 42.24.080, and those expense reimbursement claims certified as required by RCW 42.24.090, have been recorded on a listing which has been emailed to the Board members November 2, 2018.

Payroll

Check Register Number	Check Number/ Number		Date of Issue	In the Amount	
521-18	80005	80026	10/12/2018	\$ 458,306.93	Payroll
522-18	80027	80048	10/26/2018	\$462,397.45	Payroll
Total				\$920,704.38	

Non-Payroll Vouchers

Check Register Number	Check Number/ Number		Date of Issue	In the Amount	
195-18	69332	69390	10/4/2018	\$304,652.63	MDSE
196-18	69391	69454	10/9/2018	\$553,308.49	MDSE
197-18	ACH TRANS		10/9/2018	\$322,056.21	ACH TRANS
198-18	69455	69461	10/12/2018	\$18,369.66	MDSE
199-18	ACH TRANS		10/12/2018	\$433,360.50	ACH TRANS
200-18	69462	69497	10/19/2018	\$246,416.26	MDSE
201-18	69498	69606	10/26/2018	\$827,710.41	MDSE
202-18	ACH TRANS		10/31/2018	185,299.22	ACH TRANS
Total:				\$2,891,173.38	

Check register numbers 521-18 to 522-18 and 195-18 to 202-18;

In the total amount of: \$3,811,877.76

CHAIRMAN WATKINS read aloud the items on the Consent Agenda. The floor was opened for comments and questions.

JOHN TRUMBO raised a question regarding 9A. Approval of October 11, 2018 Special Board Meeting Minutes.

Ms. Boyce stated there were three transcription errors on 9B. Approval of October 11, 2018 Board Meeting Minutes

CHAIRMAN WATKINS stated both items 9A. and 9B will be moved to the ACTION agenda for discussion. He then called for a motion on CONSENT AGENDA item 9C. October Voucher Summary.

ACTION: RICHARD BLOOM made LISA STADE seconded a motion to approve the Consent Agenda as presented.

(BFT Board Committees Recommended Approval of Consent Items to the Full Board of Directors)

10. Action Items

A. Staff requested action on ARC contract be amended to extend operating hours in perpetuity

ACTION: RICHARD BLOOM made a motion to Authorize the General Manager to amend the ARC contract to extend operating hours at night, and LISA STADE seconded a motion. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

JOHN TRUMBO inquired on the contract term length. Ms. Boyce stated it is 3 years contract with up to two one-year extensions.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS requested a report back n the progress of this action. Ms. Boyce agreed.

B. Resolution 52-2018 – Receive and file the WA State Auditor’s Office 2017 Accountability Audit Report

CHAIRMAN WATKINS stated this is a pro forma item and does not need full presentation and asked Matthew Branson, Interim Director of Administrative Services for any comments. Mr. Branson expressed his thanks to staff for a clean audit.

ACTION: STEVE BECKEN made a motion to approved Resolution 52-2018 – Receive and file the WA State Auditor’s Office 2017 Accountability Audit Report, and BOB KOCH seconded a motion.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS opened for questions and comments. JOHN TRUMBO inquired on the financial audit. Mr. Branson stated that work was completed earlier this year and received and filed in July 2018. JOHN TRUMBO continued to ask if there is a private CPA-house do an audit for BFT. Mr. Branson stated both accountability and financial audits are done by the state. JOHN TRUMBO asked if there are any additional audits done on BFT. Mr. Branson stated Moss Adams does a ridership audit. JOHN TRUMBO confirmed that this is a spot-audit and not a full audit. Mr. Branson confirmed, yes.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for a vote. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

C. Resolution 53 – 2018: Authorizing the General Manager to enter into a Contract with Brasco International, Inc. for Bus Stop and Transit Center Shelters

Bill Barlow, Planning Manager, The Ben Franklin Transit (BFT) Board of Directors approved the release of proposals for bus stop and transit center shelters on August 9, 2018. BFT searched for a contractor to provide bus stop shelters that enhance and incorporate elements of our community and address the rapidly growing community that we serve. Amenities are an important element of BFT's transit service. They provide riders with comfort and safety and form the community's perception of its transit system. Staff has been coordinating with local jurisdictions planning for amenities placement. Coordination has allowed BFT to partner with agencies for bus stop shelters locations that are in line with jurisdictional priorities; creating cost efficiency and mitigating redundancy. BFT staff requested proposals and received two proposals that were determined to be responsive and responsible. BFT staff evaluated and scored the proposals to determine the highest rated firm. The highest scoring proposal was received from Brasco International, Inc. Brasco also had the lowest cost proposal on the comparative offer.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS asked that this order accounts for about half of the system stops.

ACTION: JOHN TRUMBO made, and RICHARD BLOOM seconded a motion to approve Resolution 53 – 2018: Authorizing the General Manager to enter into a Contract with Brasco International, Inc. for Bus Stop and Transit Center Shelters.

JOHN TRUMBO clarified the budgeted amounts as previously approved by the Board. CHAIRMAN WATKINS opened for discussion and called for a vote. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

D. Resolution 54 – 2018 – Approve the Updated Capital Improvement Plan, Adopt the FY 2019 Operating & Capital Budgets, and Authorize the General Manager to file all FY 2019 Federal and State Grants

Matthew Branson, Interim Director of Administrative Services stated the Ben Franklin Transit (BFT) Board of Directors met on October 11, 2018 at 5:00 PM in a Special Budget Meeting to discuss the 2019 proposed operating and capital budget for BFT. At the Regular Board meeting that followed, the Board authorized the release of the proposed Fiscal Year 2019 Operating and Capital Budget for a public review and comment period. To date, BFT has not received any public comments. The proposed Fiscal Year 2019 Operating Budget of \$42,022,300 and Capital budget of \$22,012,566 as presented are balanced with 2019 Operating Revenues, Federal/State Awards and Reserves. Mr. Branson stated that a public comment period, engagement with the Citizen's Advisory Network (CAN) and a special budget meeting with the Board were had. CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for a motion.

ACTION: STEVE BECKEN made, and RICHARD BLOOM seconded a motion to approve Resolution 54 – 2018 – Approve the Updated Capital Improvement Plan, Adopt the FY 2019 Operating & Capital Budgets, and Authorize the General Manager to file all FY 2019 Federal and State Grants. CHAIRMAN WATKINS opened for questions.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS stated that given the circumstance of Tri City Taxi, will the budget need be amended. Gloria Boyce, stated at this point, staff are asking for budget approval until a decision

is made. JOHN TRUMBO inquired on if the strategy be implemented by staff or will it come to the Board. Ms. Boyce stated that decision will be made by the Board of Directors. A brief discussion was held. CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for a vote. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

E. Approval of October 11, 2018 Board Meeting Minutes

CHAIRMAN WATKINS noted three small corrections to the October 11, 2018 Board minutes and called for a motion.

ACTION: RICHARD BLOOM made a motion to approve the October 11, 2018 Board Meeting Minutes as amended and JOHN TRUMBO seconded a motion.

F. Approval of October 11, 2018 Special Board Meeting Minutes

ACTION: RICHARD BLOOM made a motion to approve the October 11, 2018 Board Special Meeting Minutes as amended and BOB KOCH seconded a motion.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS called for comments. JOHN TRUMBO stated he was in attendance at the October 11, 2018 Special Board Meeting. Mrs. Para stated the changes will be reflected as requested. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

11. Discussion/Information Items – None.

12. Staff Reports & Comments

D. Legal Report

Jeremy Bishop, Legal Counsel, stated there is a need for an executive session RCW 42.30.110(1)(i)(iii) to discuss potential litigation. No action anticipated.

E. Financial Report

Matthew Branson, Interim Director of Administrative Services, stated operating revenues through September 30 are on track, operating expenditures are trending under budget. Treasurers' report included July information: deposits are secure, reserve funds are accounted for. Sales Tax revenue increased 8.4% in October 2018 for August 2018 business as compared to August 2017. BFT notes a YTD increase of 7.3% as compared to the same periods in 2017. Receipts in October for August sales were \$3.13M. Additional financials were included in the Board packet.

F. General Manager's Report

Gloria Boyce, General Manager, provided the Board with a review of this month's notable topics:

- Government Affairs Update
 - Federal:
 - No transit-related updates at this time.

- State
 - No major news at the state level.
- Operations
 - A couple of bright notes to end the evening:
 - Regarding our vehicles; with the delivery of our six buses in October, we are now in a State of Good Repair meaning all 53 buses (44 maximum pullout plus 9 spares) are less than 12 years old. The last time BFT's bus fleet was in a State of Good Repair was 1988. Almost there with our DAR and Vanpool fleets.
 - Fleet reserves 6.7 million.
 - And finally, our October ridership is up 5.5% over last year primarily due to the increased frequency of our Saturday Service and Route 123. (Chart provided to the Board). Brief Discussion was held.

Ms. Boyce closed her report and wished everyone a Happy Thanksgiving. Ms. Boyce opened for questions.

Upcoming Board Calendar

Operations and Maintenance Committee

December 5, 2018
BFT Room 360A – 12:30 PM

Planning and Marketing Committee

December 5, 2018
BFT Room 360A – 8:00 AM

Administration and Finance Committee

December 6, 2018
BFT Room 360A – 4:30 PM

Regular Board Meeting

December 13, 2018
BFT Board Room – 7:00PM

Citizen's Advisory Network (CAN) Meeting

January 2019 - TBD

13. Board Member Comments

- A. JOHN TRUMBO – No report
- B. RICHARD BLOOM – W. Richland will have their Veteran's day parade on Saturday November 10.
- C. CHAIRMAN MATT WATKINS – no report.
- D. BOB KOCH – No report.
- E. STEVE BECKEN – No report.
- F. LISA STADE – No report.

14. Next Meeting:

Special Board Meeting – Monday, November 26, 2018 at 5:00 p.m.
BFT MOA Board Room, 1000 Columbia Park Trail, Richland, WA

Regular Board Meeting – Thursday, December 13, 2018 at 7:00 p.m.
BFT MOA Board Room, 1000 Columbia Park Trail, Richland WA

15. Executive Session

Jeremy Bishop requested the presence of legal, Mr. Rob Orvis, and General Manager.

CHAIRMAN WATKINS stated Executive Session would last until approximately 9:15 p.m.

At 9:15 p.m. CHAIRMAN WATKINS called those still present in and reconvened the meeting.
No action was taken.

16. Adjournment

CHAIRMAN WATKINS adjourned the BFT Board of Directors meeting at 9:15 p.m.

Meeting recorded by:
Amanda Para, Clerk of the Board
November 8, 2018